

Restricted Circulation



AGENDA

22nd MEETING

PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

1545 hrs/ October 09, 2014

LBSNAA, Mussoorie

Lal Bahadur Shastri National Academy of Administration, Mussoorie

CONTENTS

Item No	Agenda	Page No
1.	Confirmation of minutes of the 21 st Meeting of PMC held on August 13, 2014	3
2.	Action Taken Report of 21 st PMC meeting	4
3.	Course Review of the ongoing Round 8 of Phase-III of MCT Programme	5
4.	Course Report of Phase-IV Round 9, 2014	7
5.	Any other item/s with the permission of the chair	10
(i)	Annexure A - Minutes of the 21 st PMC Meeting held on August 13, 2014	11
(ii)	Annexure B – Copy of the End-of-Course Report of Phase-IV Round 9, 2014	13

ITEM 1 – Confirmation of minutes of the 21st Meeting of the PMC held on August 13, 2014

1. Minutes of the last meeting held on August 13, 2014 were circulated by e-mail to all members of the Committee.

2. The same are placed at **Annexure I**.

ITEM 2 – Action Taken Report of 21st PMC meeting

Item No.	Minutes of 21 st Meeting	Action Taken
1	<p>1. Agenda Item No 2 – Action Taken Report on the minutes of the 20th meeting of the PMC – The report presented by the Academy was taken note of. In addition, it was decided that the sessional feedback format being used by Sciences Po, Paris would be examined by the Academy and also shared with FSI.</p>	<p>The Sessional Feedback format of Sciences Po is being currently examined by the Academy. The same has also been shared with FSI.</p>
4.	<p>(i) The Director raised the issue regarding reducing the duration of the MCT courses, especially Phase III and IV by one week each, in order to have better logistic fit with Induction Training at the Academy. A related point of courses having fewer participants (say 60 against the general norm of 100-120) was also discussed. The issue of restructuring Phase V, in terms of optimal years of seniority and feasibility of a Foreign Study Tour was also discussed.</p> <p>(ii) It was decided that the Academy would examine FSI's web-based system of inviting suggestions and feedback from target group of officers on resource persons.</p> <p>(iii) It was agreed that there should be greater sharing of resources between the Academy and FSI. The guidelines on compensation payable to domestic and international resource persons for MCT Programme would be shared by the Academy with FSI.</p>	<p>A proposal in this regard has been sent to the Ministry for reducing the duration of Phase III and IV to 7 weeks. A decision regarding Phase V will be taken in due course.</p> <p>Is pending and will be taken up shortly.</p> <p>A copy of the relevant O.M.s in this regard has been sent to FSI.</p>

ITEM 3 – Course Review of the on-going Round 8 of Phase-III of MCT Programme

1. Round 8 of the Phase-III of IAS Mid-Career Training Programme is concluding on 10th October. The course was attended by 101 IAS officers of 8-10 years of seniority. In addition, one officer of the 2005 batch who had missed a part of his Phase-III programme last year, and 4 officers of 2004 batch attended the foreign study tour with the present group.
2. The design of the Phase-III programme has drawn upon the broad learnings of the past rounds. The highlights of this course are as follows:
 - a. The themes of Project Appraisal and Public Private Partnership were retained from the last years programme. However, theme of 'Governance Issues and Public Service Delivery' was concurrently run in the first three weeks.
 - b. The next three weeks of the course were organized on the broad themes of Leadership, Urban Development, Rural Development & Decentralization; Agriculture; Health; Education; Public Finance.
 - c. Literary Festival was organised on 1st & 2nd October, 2014
 - d. Films have been used as a pedagogical tool.
 - e. Experience sharing by the participants was also structured on the programme.
3. The two weeks Foreign Study Tour was organized in Seoul and Busan, South Korea in collaboration with KDI, Seoul. Class room sessions on economic development, Public Service System, Human Capital, Health Policy, Health Care Financing Policy, The export oriented Industrialization Policy in Korea, FDI Policy, Government Reform, Business-Government relations in Korea Focused on the role of Chaebols were covered by faculty members drawn from KDI and various Universities. The theoretical inputs imparted in the classroom were followed by site visits. Hence, participants were taken to elementary school, hospital, traffic management center, polytechnic, vocational training university, SEZ, manufacturing hub etc.

On the way to Busan, a field trip was organized in Gyeongsangbuk-do Provincial Government for an understanding of rural development institutions in South Korea. Participants got a direct exposure to agriculture, agriculture marketing, local schools & hospitals, water supply and waste management systems. From

Busan, trips were arranged to Hyundai automobiles, Hyundai Heavy Industries, Busan and urban ports. Overall, it was a very educative and inspiring programme which was well received by the participants.

4. The participants were required to write a Korea Paper individually and a project report in cohorts of 5-6, as well as take an examination for evaluation purpose. While writing the Korea Paper, the participants were expected to analyze a sector in Korea and bring out learning points in Indian context. In the Project report, project appraisal techniques were used by participants to analyze the project from various '*points of view*' and give their recommendations. The participants were expected to present the project analysis before a select panel for evaluation. Marks were also awarded under Director's Assessment based on their performance in participation in class, extra-curricular activities, games & sports and discipline
5. The Academy attempts to deliver a healthy mix of lectures and presentations both by experts and academics, Government practitioners, civil society members and political leaders. Various teaching methods, viz. lectures, panel discussions, case studies, movies followed by discussion and experience sharing have been used for delivering inputs. The summary of the sessional feedback for Week-01 to Week-06 is placed for information:

Week	LBSNAA Faculty*	Guest Faculty**	KDI	Overall
1	85.62%	85.16%	-	85.53%
2	83.59%	79.46%	-	82.14%
3	86.10%	85.66%	-	85.97%
4	90.20%	87.71%	-	88.58%
5&6	-	-	84%	84%
Overall	86.34%	84.50%	84%	85.25%

*LBSNAA Faculty- 51 Sessions

** Guest Faculty- 29 Sessions

6. This is placed for the information of the Committee.

ITEM 4 – Course Report of Phase-IV round 9, 2014 (23rd June to 14th August, 2014)

1	Title of the Course	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Phase IV of Mid Career Training Programme of IAS Officers
2	Duration & Date	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> June 23 to August 14, 2014 - (8 weeks) Foreign Study Tour to Canada and France - July 14 to 25, 2014 - (2 weeks) The Course was conducted at the Academy in Mussoorie.
3	Course Team of the Academy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shri Tejveer Singh, Course Coordinator Smt. Nidhi Sharma, Deputy Directors (Sr.) and Prof. Amar KJR Nayak – Associate Course Coordinators.
4	Introduction of the Course	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The programme aims to prepare the officers for upcoming assignments in the areas of public policy formulation and analysis. Accordingly policy analysis. Policy implementation and praxis. Public management and leadership constitute its key elements. It also seeks to update their knowledge in the major domains of governance.
5	Programme meant for Target Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Participants drawn from IAS Officers of 1991, 1992, 1993, 1994, 1995, 1996, 1997, 1998 and 1999 Batches.
6	Composition of Group-Service represented and male/female break up For conference format only male/female break-up is required	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Total Participants – 57 IAS Officers- Male – 46 Female – 11 Residual Participants - 1
7	Programme Inaugurated by	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inaugural Address by Shri Rajeev Kapoor, Director
8	Valedictory address by	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Valedictory Address by Shri B. S. Baswan, IAS (Retd.)

Course Objectives: The main objective of the training programme was to support officers to make the transition from programme management to becoming effective and responsive policy formulators and implementers. By the end of the course, the participants were able to:

- Appreciate contemporary development in political economy at the global and national level,
- Understand the process of public policy formulation, analysis and evaluation,
- Enhance domain knowledge in the context of the process of public policy,
- Strengthen leadership and negotiation skills, and
- Appreciate the centrality of values in governance.

Course Design

- Week 1 – Understanding Public Policy
- Week 2 – Policy Analysis & Evaluation
- Week 3 – Public Service Delivery
- Week 4 & 5 – Foreign Study Tour to Canada and France
- Week 6 – Economic Policy, PPPs and Regulation
- Week 7 – Sectorial updates, Leadership and Negotiation
- Week 8 – Perspective Building

Academy Faculty

Shri Rajeev Kapoor, Shri Sanjeev Chopra, Shri Dushyant Nariala, Shri Tejveer Singh, Smt. Ranjana Chopra, Smt. Jaspreet Talwar, Dr. Prem Singh, Smt. Nidhi Sharma, Shri Ram Kumar Kakani, Dr. Amar KJR Nayak.

Guest Speakers

Shri Padamvir Singh, Shri Sanjeev Chopra, Dr. Suman Sahai, Smt. Aruna Rodrigues, Shri Shekhar Gupta, Hon'ble Mr. Justice Madan B. Lokur, Dr. Gyanendra Dhar Badgaiyan, Dr. Jayaprakash Narayan, Dr. Dean Spears, Dr. Manish Kumar, Mr. Joep Verhagen, Shri S.K. Das, Dr. N.C. Saxena, Shri T.R. Raghunandan, Mr. Jim Nickel, Shri K.L. Sharma, Prof. Julian LeGrand, Mr. Amarjeet Sinha, Prof. Shubhashish Gangopadhyay, Dr. Shalini Rajneesh, Dr. Rajendra Kumar, Prof. Rohini Pande, Dr. Charity Troyer Moore, Mr. Hardik Shah, Mr. Theodore Svoronos, Dr. Ajay Chhibber, Dr. Roli Asthana, Dr. V Bhaskar, Dr. YV Reddy, Dr. KP Krishnan, Shri Vivek Aggarwal, Shri Vivek Aggarwal, Shri Cherian Thomas, Shri A. Balasubramanian, Shri. Sandeep Verma, Shri Shivraj Singh Chauhan, Shri JS Deepak, Dr. Nachiket Mor, Dr. Vinod Paul, Dr. Abhey Bang, Shri Anshu Prakash, Prof. Karthik Muralidharan, Shri Jasmine Shah, Smt. Vrinda Sarup, Shri Ashok Thakur, Prof. Jerome Joseph,

Shri JS Deepak, Dr. Navroz Dubash, Shri Vinod Rai, Dr. Dilip Simeon, Prof. Arvind Panagariya, Shri G Parthasarthy, Shri Gurcharan Das, Dr. Rathin Roy.

Course Feedback

Sessional Feedback

Week	LBSNAA Faculty*	Guest Faculty	Overall
1	87.63%	82.36%	85.13%
2	89.90%	83.37%	84.91%
3	87.37%	80.99%	81.34%
4 & 5	<i>FST</i>	<i>FST</i>	<i>FST</i>
6	90.49%	90.87%	90.70%
7	96.21%	87.65%	91.07%
8	95.41%	85.08%	87.14%
Overall	92.50%	85.29%	87.75%

*Exclusive of Course briefings, review of Classroom Exercises, Feedback sessions, etc taken by Academy Faculty.

End-of-Course Feedback

The weighted average of the overall End-of-Course Feedback given by participants about the course (based upon its usefulness, training experience, etc.) was **98%**. Copy of the detailed Feedback report is attached at **Annexure B**.

ITEM 5 – Any other item/s with the permission of the chair

1. Any other issue/s may be taken up for discussion with the permission of the Chair.

MINUTES OF THE 21ST MEETING OF THE PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE OF MID CAREER TRAINING PROGRAMME HELD AT 3.45 PM ON AUGUST 13, 2014 AT LBSNAA, MUSSOORIE

The following were present:

1. Sh. Rajeev Kapoor, Director LBSNAA – *in chair*
2. Sh. Alok Kumar, Joint Secretary, Training Division (DoPT)
3. Dr. Rathin Roy, Director NIPF&P, New Delhi
4. Dr. Peter Ronald deSouza – *through video conferencing from New Delhi*
5. Sh. GV Srinivas, IFS, Joint Secretary, Foreign Service Institute, Delhi - *through video conferencing from New Delhi*
6. Sh. Sanjeev Chopra, Joint Director LBSNAA
7. Sh. Tejveer Singh, Joint Director LBSNAA

After discussion, the following decisions were taken on the agenda items listed below:

2. **Agenda Item No 1 – Confirmation of minutes of the 20th meeting of the PMC dated June 17, 2014** – The Committee took note of the comments sent by email dated June 23, 2014 by Dr. Peter Ronald deSouza and the response presented by the Academy on the points raised therein. It was decided that suggestions of members regarding eminent domestic and international experts on various themes/ domains would be solicited to build up a resource base in the Academy. The suggestion of inviting more speakers from developing economies in Phase IV and V was also accepted. Taking note of the above said suggestions, the Committee amended the minutes of the last meeting which are placed as Annexure I.
3. **Agenda Item No 2 – Action Taken Report on the minutes of the 20th meeting of the PMC** – The report presented by the Academy was taken note of. In addition, it was decided that the sessional feedback format being used by Sciences Po, Paris would be examined by the Academy and also shared with FSI.
4. **Agenda Item No. 3 – Review of progress of Round 9 of Phase IV of MCT Programme** – The Committee expressed satisfaction with the progress of the Phase IV, including the first Foreign Study Tour to France organized in collaboration with Sciences Po, Paris. It advised the Academy to still explore the possibility of sending groups to emerging economies. The suggestion of Dr. Peter Ronald deSouza regarding having sessions on contemporary political events, such as the present crisis in Iraq, and relating them to the larger issue of collapse of the state in the present case, was taken note of. The summary of the feedback session taken with course participants prior to the meeting is placed as Annexure II.

5. **Agenda Item No 4 – Update on Phase III, Round 8 2014** – The Committee took note of the course design and accorded its approval. It was also decided that the emerging areas of concern in the implementation of PPP projects, both domestically and internationally, should find reflection in the PPP module being delivered in the Academy.
6. **Agenda Item No 5 – Update of Phase V Round 8, 2014** – The course design and detailed timetable was presented by Sh. Sanjeev Chopra. Dr. Peter Ronald deSouza offered to suggest some globally-acclaimed experts for the international component being organized in the United States. The Committee noted that the timetables stood almost confirmed; however, in case of any possibility, the suggestions would be considered for the ensuing round.

The Committee also made some observations with regard to the domestic component, viz. on the sessions on Rural Development and City Management session by Scot Wrighton. It was observed that the sessions on Rural Development should present contrarian perspectives and focus on the contemporary challenges facing the rural sector. On the proposed session of Mr. Scot Wrighton, it was pointed out by Mr. Sanjeev Chopra, Joint Director that the resource person had been suggested by Mr. Bimal Patel (who is coordinating the Urban Module) being one of the foremost international city managers working in India. It was also clarified that he would not be speaking in his capacity as representative of Lavasa city but as a city manager with wide international experience, which would be useful for the participants. It was decided that the Academy would examine the observations of the members to further refine the timetable.

The Committee endorsed the suggestion of the Academy of presenting a cluster of policy problem statements to participants for writing their policy paper.

7. **Other item/s taken up for discussion**

- (iv) The Director raised the issue regarding reducing the duration of the MCT courses, especially Phase III and IV by one week each, in order to have better logistic fit with Induction Training at the Academy. A related point of courses having fewer participants (say 60 against the general norm of 100-120) was also discussed. The issue of restructuring Phase V, in terms of optimal years of seniority and feasibility of a Foreign Study Tour was also discussed.
- (v) It was decided that the Academy would examine FSI's web-based system of inviting suggestions and feedback from target group of officers on resource persons.
- (vi) It was agreed that there should be greater sharing of resources between the Academy and FSI. The guidelines on compensation payable to domestic and international resource persons for MCT Programme would be shared by the Academy with FSI.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the chair.

**Mid-Career Training Programme IAS Phase IV Round 9, 2014
End-of-Course Feedback**

Total Respondents: 50

1. .

	2 Months or more prior	1 to 2 months prior	1 month to 15 days prior	Less than 15 days prior		W.Average
1) When did you first receive information about your likely participation in the Programme	17 34.00	16 32.00	9 18.00	8 16.00		54.00

2. .

	Yes	No		W.Average
1) Did you peruse the Course Manual outlining the Objectives and other details at the start of the course	41 82.00	9 18.00		59.00

3. Following were the major course objectives: 1. Appreciate contemporary developments in political economy at the global and national level, 2. Understand the process of public policy formulation, analysis and evaluation, 3. Enhance domain knowledge in the context of public policy, 4. Strengthen leadership and negotiation skills, and 5. Appreciate the centrality of values in governance

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Did you find the course objectives related to and relevant for	0 0.00	0 0.00	1 2.00	18 36.00	31 62.00		92.00
2) Your future work	0 0.00	0 0.00	0 0.00	16 32.00	34 68.00		93.60

3) Your overall development	0	0	0	18	32		92.80
	0.00	0.00	0.00	36.00	64.00		

4.

1) What are the changes in the course objectives that you would like to suggest by way of addition, alteration or deletion?

- None
- More faculties from premier US/ European Universities should be invited to speak on topics on relevance and emerging concepts/ practices. The course tried to do it by inviting
- Professors from LSE/ Columbia/UCSD etc. Those sessions are found to be very useful. More of such leading faculties shall be invited. Foreign component is extremely useful and can be made more useful by partnering with universities.
- Topics on GOI's "Look East "policy for socio-economic and overall development of North East region may be added next time for phase II,III & IV
- Delete values because I don't think values are to be taught. more focus on PPP, procurement
- Policy making for industrial development, foreign policy designing may be added. There can be some lectures on service delivery & good governance.
- Border problems of interstate and international issue are included.
- Please allow family during the Foreign Study Tour, and sandwich it between 5th and 8th weeks.
- International Trade Aspects need to be included
- Some sectors were not given due justice, such as Power, Finance, Contracts and agreements, Labor Laws, Security.
- These subject may be given little more attention in future course.,
- addition: social media and governance
- follow-up on line course on evidence based policy design
- KEEP THE FOREIGN STUDY IN LAST
- In my opinion objectives are well defined.
- duration of course to be 6 weeks
- course objective is good
- Nothing in particular.
- Instead of focusing too much on various aspects, it would be better if the course is designed exclusively too specific domain and skill set. Policy formulation and analysis would be the most appropriate for that. The current format provides a glance of everything without a concrete takeaway at the end of the course.
- Emphasis on professionalism and excellence should also be major objectives. We need to study and learn how to design systems which are effective.
- We may run a capstone kind of project all through 8 weeks.
- i think agriculture and environment sectors should have been given a more space in the course .

- Please add module on drafting legislation just like cabinet note writing exercise
- case study methodology and more use of e-resources
- leadership module should be done in first week
- it is well designed
- Appropriate
- more analytical abilities especially incorporating IT solutions
- There could be more elaboration in terms of more intensive inputs in the second objective
- inclusion of politicians in the panel for making effective policies so that they can also be made aware of the strengths of evidence based policy formulation.
- an input on writing legislation, proper documentation in Govt
- Some classes be kept for experience sharing also.
- More focus on case studies. More interaction with practitioners and experts.
- good speakers from china in the field of Infrastructure, social sector, health ,education, finance, etc. will help because china didn't start rich but from similar levels from that of India. Secondly, Peer group learning sessions can be introduced. Interested ones can send their topic, hard/ soft copies to Academy for shortlisting. Even shortlisting can be done by peer review.
- It was very aptly designed. More field visits during foreign exposure visit can be added.
- More case studies, faculties may be drawn from both public /Govt and private sectors who actually implemented or formulated some successful programmes. More panel discussions may be made. Political executive may also sensitized about new happenings in the administrative arena. Group presentations and module on public speaking may be included. In addition to success stories we can have failure stories as well so that reasons for failures can also be analyzed so that we could be aware of those factors while formulating policies and programmes.
- career development along with changing role of bureaucracy

5. Programme Design: How would you rate the following

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Area and subject coverage	0	0	1	16	33		92.80
	0.00	0.00	2.00	32.00	66.00		
2) Orientation to present assignment & future charges over next 5 years	0	0	2	18	30		91.20
	0.00	0.00	4.00	36.00	60.00		
3) Distribution of time among various components of the course	0	0	2	29	19		86.80
	0.00	0.00	4.00	58.00	38.00		
4) Sequencing	0	0	5	25	20		86.00
	0.00	0.00	10.00	50.00	40.00		

5) Suggestions, if any:

- Please include training of referencing software
- Duration is appropriate. More international perspectives would be useful.
- more time for economics, infrastructure
- The course design as well as the course contents has been outstanding.
- More courses on Economics and International Trade and Negotiations
- foreign visit can be towards end
- more time could be given to case studies in place of few video conferences
- CALL EMINENT POLITICIANS ALSO
- More presentations from participants
- course duration could be reduce to 6 weeks
- Nothing in particular
- Focus on policy formulation and analysis only in the entire course would be more useful in my view.
- FST can be in the last of the training.
- It should have included more field visits. Also stress on theory part in policy design should have been less.
- Public Policy Theories need not be repeated in FST.
- time table for the entire program should be drawn at once in the beginning
- repetition in the contents of policy making and evaluation could have been avoided
- a simulation exercise on an international negotiation may be introduced
- In future, the module on Leadership is kept in the beginning.
- Soft skill modules could have been at the beginning.
- Talks/ participation by political executive will fill in the gap. Constitution provides for democracy and executive is above the bureaucracy.
- The duration of the programme is optimum. No need for reduction of duration which may result in less productivity and usefulness.
- soft skills should be taught in the beginning and they should be evaluated in the end as well so that we can see whether any change in behavior is evident or not
- optional modules on domains would be welcome

6. Kindly indicate the usefulness of the training material

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Background readings	0	1	3	26	20		86.00
	0.00	2.00	6.00	52.00	40.00		
2) Classroom material given in form of cases, handouts, etc	0	0	5	24	21		86.40
	0.00	0.00	10.00	48.00	42.00		

3) How did the following pedagogical methods employed in the programme appeal to you	0	0	3	20	27		89.60
	0.00	0.00	6.00	40.00	54.00		
4) Case Study Method	0	0	2	16	32		92.00
	0.00	0.00	4.00	32.00	64.00		
5) Use of Short Films	0	0	2	7	41		95.60
	0.00	0.00	4.00	14.00	82.00		
6) Panel Discussion	0	1	5	20	24		86.80
	0.00	2.00	10.00	40.00	48.00		
7) Seminars	1	0	6	21	22		85.20
	2.00	0.00	12.00	42.00	44.00		

8) Suggestions, if any:

- More relevant research papers and articles can be provided.
- Maybe, more case studies, including those from foreign countries, especially China, should be incorporated.
- Divide the class into 4 groups at beginning of the course and allow us to evolve solutions to at least one common topic from different perspective, will make it live and produce a document worthy of practical usage
- Online training Modules may also be developed.
- more case studies required
- INCREASE TIME LIMIT
- Include more video conferencing with Ministers and Secretaries in Gol
- Readings and presentation should be uploaded in advance for better preparation of the participant and more meaningful discussions
- Invite people from diverse views and fields on the panel
- more panel discussions and debates needed
- We should be allowed to use SARGAM facility even after we leave Course
- Case study method can be a norm .There could be more panel discussions and employment of simulation method for negotiations etc
- documentaries based on public interaction
- more assignments and case studies could be added
- Panel discussion could have proponents from opposing views.
- Peer group learning can also be introduced. Maybe half an hour daily slot in the evening.
- group presentation and individual presentation should more than often used to impart training to develop the skills
- Case studies could be simulated and should be followed by panel discussion. panels need to be more broad based and representative

7. How did the following evaluation methods employed in the programme appeal to you

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) FST Paper	0	0	3	16	31		91.20
	0.00	0.00	6.00	32.00	62.00		
2) Policy Essay	0	0	2	14	34		92.80
	0.00	0.00	4.00	28.00	68.00		
3) Cabinet Note Writing	1	1	4	12	32		89.20
	2.00	2.00	8.00	24.00	64.00		
4) Group Work in Seminar on IAS	1	0	6	20	23		85.60
	2.00	0.00	12.00	40.00	46.00		
5) Case Study Presentation	0	0	0	19	31		92.40
	0.00	0.00	0.00	38.00	62.00		
6) Director's Assessment	0	0	5	19	26		88.40
	0.00	0.00	10.00	38.00	52.00		

7) Suggestions, if any:

- Option should be given to either type or write the policy essay
- Cabinet note is basically a clerical exercise and should be done away with. Academy can add a brief project report in its place.
- fairly Good
- more case studies
- INCLUDE SPORTS FOR EVALUAION
- There should have been FST presentation by groups.
- Excellent team work!
- This format of assessment is fine
- For group work, groups should be restricted to only 3-4 officers
- Directors assessment is going to be in turn CC's assessment again i think..i am afraid he does not make up his mind on memos one received...
- Individual presentations and paper submission should be given more weightage with no or least on director's assessment.
- Writing FST was of no use. presentations would have helped learn more
- some sessions on drafting and documentation must be there
- Exam should be at the end of every week covering the topics discussed during that week
- I think Cabinet note writing exercise in the way it is structured now does not fulfill its objective. IT can be a group exercise with given topics/sectors so as to be able to make in-depth study and analysis necessary for making policy suggestions.
- There could be more case study presentations. Even individual case study presentations may be included.

- The Cabinet note, FST paper of the participants should be sent to the concerned Ministries and secretaries in the GOI and States. Phase IV participants have enough experience to suggest policy level changes in GOI or states. Who else will better suggest. The quality of papers written will improve and the flexibility of reception by secretaries will improve over time. Some sort of incentivization by Academy/ Govt. in non-pecuniary form may be thought of whose policy suggestions get adopted and implemented by the govt. after all it is done in the interest of the society.
- group and individual presentation method to be used
- cabinet note should have a policy given and only written on that --- an exercise on documenting should be done

8. How do you rate the following administrative aspects of the programme

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Office Assistance Services	0	0	2	14	34		92.80
	0.00	0.00	4.00	28.00	68.00		
2) Classroom Facilities	0	0	1	6	43		96.80
	0.00	0.00	2.00	12.00	86.00		
3) Hostel Room Facilities	0	0	2	10	38		94.40
	0.00	0.00	4.00	20.00	76.00		
4) Housekeeping & Room Service	0	1	4	16	29		89.20
	0.00	2.00	8.00	32.00	58.00		
5) Food Quality and Mess Service	1	0	10	20	19		82.40
	2.00	0.00	20.00	40.00	38.00		
6) Recreational Facilities	1	0	4	15	30		89.20
	2.00	0.00	8.00	30.00	60.00		
7) Sports Facilities	1	0	2	12	35		92.00
	2.00	0.00	4.00	24.00	70.00		
8) Transport Arrangements	0	1	9	17	23		84.80
	0.00	2.00	18.00	34.00	46.00		

9) Suggestions, if any:

- Bar facility should be allowed function on all days
- Weekly(Saturday)bus service upto Gandhi Chowk for marketing/shopping
- a special word of praise for the housekeeping and room service-brilliant !!
- Academy foods need to improve in taste and preparation. Question of hygiene is very important so that half the group do not have upset stomach. Please provide bottle water to all. Treated water is seriously compromised here.

- Silver wood was very good, Mahanadi needs a little improvement; Mess Food had their crests and troughs..overall experience was good
- Gym may be provided with towels and classes may be provided with water.
- kindly provide I-pad in class on interactive mode and for conducting classes
- The food quality deteriorated over the period and water quality was bad; was down severe stomach infection twice during the course.
- ASK TO PLY NEW VEHICLES
- There could have been more outdoor weekend activities.
- no outside foods/sweets should be available in the mess
- Permission to family should be restricted to only lady officers who small kids of 1 to 2 years. Permission to full set of family create chaos in mess as well as surroundings.
- PI provides one Iron and a small refrigerator in every room. Academy should have a large gymnasium hall that can accommodate at least three basketball / tennis courts, with movable partitions.
- Happy valley hostel has many teething problems. The pantry in the hostel can be run for more hours.
- morning pt should be either morning or evening
- Too good. no suggestion
- After undergoing training 16 years before, it is unbelievable that academy has improved leaps and bounds. This is particularly important as Academy is known to have officers who achieved more in preaching than in practice. I must say that right from bathing water to drinking water quality everything was a problem then. Now it is a joyful learning.
- Transport facility for going upto library point must be available.
- Hostel, sports, recreational facilities make the training more enjoyable. the academy deserves all the credit for making the stay a memorable one.
- Housekeeping services in silver wood was far better than in happy valley guest house. HVGH is problem of sunshine, air ventilation, etc. it is good only as a guest house and not for long duration stay. Housekeeping services in HVGH was poor, room heaters didn't get replace/ repaired despite several reminders.
- Vehicle for some urgent personal works may be given on payment basis.
- Housekeeping needs to be improved further

9. How do you rate the academic activities during the programme							
	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Public Policy Module(Overall)	0	0	3	12	35		92.80
	0.00	0.00	6.00	24.00	70.00		
2) Foreign Study Tour	0	1	2	8	39		94.00
	0.00	2.00	4.00	16.00	78.00		

3) Coverage of Domains (Economic Policy & Public Finance,	0	0	5	14	31		90.40
	0.00	0.00	10.00	28.00	62.00		
4) Soft Skills (Leadership and Negotiation)	0	1	3	13	33		91.20
	0.00	2.00	6.00	26.00	66.00		
5) General Perspective Building	0	1	2	16	31		90.80
	0.00	2.00	4.00	32.00	62.00		
7) Monitoring & Evaluation Module	0	0	2	20	28		90.40
	0.00	0.00	4.00	40.00	56.00		
8) Smart Policy Design Module (EPoD)	0	0	4	16	30		90.40
	0.00	0.00	8.00	32.00	60.00		

9) Suggestions, if any

- 1. FST should be planned at the end of training programme. 2. module on soft skills was especially good-really useful
- The course has focused on GoI to the neglect of State Government and has tried to impress as if superhuman officers serve in GoI and those in States are the leftover. This is fundamentally wrong and must be set right.
- Fairly Good
- video conferencing quality to be improved
- FST should be towards one week before the closing of the program.
- More sessions on Negotiations skill desired
- The France visit and especially the choice of the partner institute Science Po was a real value addition to our programme.
- FST should be focused on some pre decided area with deep insight
- more field visits in FST desirable
- Soft skills module was exceptional. It gave opportunity to reflect upon what we thing/thought about ourselves. It also pointed out the traits which we need to look upon.
- Speakers from political field, Chinese speakers, etc. was lacking.
- more domains need to be covered, soft skill module should have personal interaction

10. How do you rate the non-academic activities during the programme

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average

1) Morning Physical Activity	0	1	4	16	29		89.20
	0.00	2.00	8.00	32.00	58.00		
2) Weekend Treks/ Excursions	1	2	12	16	19		80.00
	2.00	4.00	24.00	32.00	38.00		
3) Co-curricular activities	1	5	8	21	15		77.60
	2.00	10.00	16.00	42.00	30.00		

4) Suggestions, if any

- One cultural programme in the first week and another one in the last week of the course/programme
- Put more items
- There could have been more outdoor weekend activities
- more outdoor activity should be planned
- power plate should be part of such a good gym
- The idea of making morning activities is good
- IT skills such as knowledge of MS-Projects, MS-Access, SQL etc should be made part of the curriculum, rather than leaving it to the choice of the participants.
- I do not think any attention or focus has been given in the area. The evening time can be utilized well for activities that build camaraderie, there is experience sharing and for personality development.
- it should not be mandatory
- fix a place for yoga

11. How do you rate the various components of the Foreign Study Tour

	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Pre-visit orientation	0	0	2	13	35		93.20
	0.00	0.00	4.00	26.00	70.00		
2) Academic inputs by partner institution	0	1	3	22	24		87.60
	0.00	2.00	6.00	44.00	48.00		
3) Site Visits	1	1	8	14	26		85.20
	2.00	2.00	16.00	28.00	52.00		
4) Boarding/ Lodging	0	3	4	10	33		89.20
	0.00	6.00	8.00	20.00	66.00		
5) Transportation	0	1	8	10	31		88.40
	0.00	2.00	16.00	20.00	62.00		

6) List one major strength:

- Interaction with peers in Canada
- Excellent partner institution. excellent boarding arrangements
- Programme Sequence
- The Niagara Programme
- focused inputs
- ACADEMIC INPUTS.
- Absolutely committed set of speakers, who were thorough in their subject. Complete professionalism and commitment.
- Site visits.
- Quality of inputs by SciencesPO.
- Speakers and range of topics, visit to European Commission
- 1. Very good rather excellent exposure of governance in foreign country 2. design of schedule was excellent in case of Canada
- self-learning while moving around
- exposure to EU and European commission was very good
- exposure to new/other systems of governance and policy emphasis
- VERY USEFUL FOR CAREER
- academic inputs about and at EU
- Speakers were excellent.
- Exposure to public policy design and implementation of a foreign nation.
- Gives a wider perspective and better outlook to the participant
- presentations on PPP
- very good coverage
- academic inputs
- Systematic and disciplined
- Academic inputs well prepared and rich
- knowledge
- the content was excellent
- simulation exercise
- Good coordination
- Well organized
- The teachers in the France visit had excellent knowledge of the field realities.
- Academic inputs by practitioners from Science Po and visit to EU
- insight in PPPs
- the exposure itself
- exposure to sectors like health and education
- academic inputs were of highest quality
- Topics chosen and quality of most of lecturers in France.
- Domain enrichment and gain of knowledge
- More inputs in less time.
- range of speakers

7) List one major weakness:

- Breakfast could have been better in Toronto
- Travel via US was not a good idea. More site visits could have been planned in Canada.
- Site visits
- not experienced
- poor hospitality
- Academic rigor was fine but the scheduling was a bit too heavy. 9am to 6pm is just too much!!
- Medical coverage.
- Very hectic schedule depriving the participants of some leisure, rest and sightseeing. Academy probably believed that sightseeing is absolutely unwarranted on government hospitality.
- Focus, design of class sessions left little time for interaction with Speakers, limited reading material...
- 1. Canada journey was too painful. 2. There was too few number of field visits
- zero interaction with the local bureaucracy and local education and health institutions
- no time for reflection
- heavy academic inputs, lesser time for site visits
- GROUP HARMONY MISSING
- more field visits should be included
- None at all.
- The quality of site visits can be improved
- Classes should only be till 4.00 pm so that one can appreciate things beyond classrooms.
- should have been more exposure visit
- poor field visits
- less field exposure
- Poor coordination by Scope.
- too much of knowledge
- very hectic schedule less discussions
- length of lectures
- I didn't find any weakness
- Though the faculty had excellent knowledge, some of them were not fluent in English and at times used to search for the right words to express.
- There should have been more number of structured visits .
- contents were mostly touched superficially
- less site visits in FST
- nothing as such
- more field visits would be welcome
- Lesser of field visits done and that too needs more structuring from point of view of learning/ reflection.
- There was no weakness.
- less interaction with faculties/less field visits/almost no interaction with practitioners
- lack of interaction

1) Please list out three significant learning's from the training programme.

- Universal Health Coverage issues, Canadian health system, Cabinet memo
- Theoretical perspectives, emerging concepts in Pub Administration/ Policy, Sectorial insights
- Learned various aspects of Policy formulations, Cabinet note writing and global perspective of governance
- (a)Public Policy Formulation,(b)Strengthening leadership and Negotiation Skill and(c)Improving Implementation ,evaluation and delivery system
- policy perspective, specific learning's in health and education, EQ insights
- 1-Public policy design process.2-Leadership evaluation & how to improve the leadership character.3- Implementation of polices for public good.
- 1. Give time to yourself, let the mind think and wander. 2. POLICY, POLICY AND POLICY
- Leadership/group works/project management.
- Build up domain competence, trust evidence and evidence alone, and don't lose sight of your career path.
- Policy Making, Evaluation & Monitoring and the European ringside view on Policy making
- 1. Public policy Design 2. Exposure to Canadian Education and Health Systeem. 3. Maintaining good health
- cabinet note, PPP, global perspective
- policy design, European commission visit, leadership module
- Policy formulation principles, indian and world perspective in policy formulation and negotiations
- Efficiency ethics and future vision
- policy formulation, leadership development, exposure during FST
- 1. Policy decision 2. Future planning 3. role of leadership
- 1. Public Policy Design Module. 2. Emotional stability. 3. Yoga
- Policy, Perspective, Leadership
- 1. Better perspective. 2. Network with colleagues. 3. Time for reflection
- 1. Evidence based policy design 2. What has gone wrong in social sector and how it can be corrected? 3. Importance of public private partnership.
- 1. I learnt about myself 2. Learnt a great deal about different aspect of policy design. 3 learnt a great deal about
- education sector
- covered wide range of topics, exposure to Canadian system of governance, it's all about the balance between intelligence and emotions
- 1. Evidence based policy design 2 Learning of leadership modules 3 Insight into social sector policies.

- 1. Skill improvement and domain knowledge 2. Discovery of strengths and weakness of service and need for competency and specialization 3. Leadership and soft skill development
- sector insights/policy analysis/ microeconomics for policy making
- public policy, negotiation module and emotional quotient
- policy framework, soft skills, case studies based learning
- orientation for specialized domain knowledge
- process of policy making, negotiation skills and improving EI
- Policy making, PPP and Financial Management
- 1) Issues and Challenges in policy formulation 2) Leadership and Behavioral skills 3) sector specific inputs
- evidence based policy formulation and evaluation, cabinet note, leadership module
- policy design, inputs on soft skills, inputs on PPP
- 1. making public policy will be easier in future and will be more effective also.2 Sensitization to Sanitation problem in the country.3. Exposure to sectors like Education and Health.
- 1. More prepared for the tasks ahead. 2. improved skills and analytical ability. 3. Soft skills.
- reinforcement of value system in public service; urgency to act fast by the country in most of social , infrastructures and human development sectors; leadership module was very good and gave skills in management of official works.
- (1). Specific knowledge gain on policy formulation. (2). Greater exposure to global policy perspective through foreign study tour. (3).Firsthand training on cabinet note writing.
- Expertise on public policy, exposure to international/global perspectives/importance of data interpretation/stretched our thinking process
- learning of soft skills, learning the policy process, learning about PPP
- Policy formulation, policy analysis, PPP module and tendering process
- Domain knowledge of Policy making and PPP. 2- Soft skill realization and need for improvement accordingly. 3. --realization of importance of skill an knowledge up gradation

13.	Neither Useful nor Memorable	Not Useful but somewhat	Somewhat Useful and	Useful and Memorable	Very Useful and Memorable		W.Average
1) How do you evaluate your Overall Experience of Training	0	0	0	5	45		98.00
	0.00	0.00	0.00	10.00	90.00		

14. General Feedback on Programme Design and Delivery	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Overall Duration of Programme	0	0	5	16	29		89.60
	0.00	0.00	10.00	32.00	58.00		

2) Suggestions, if any:

- It should be of not more than six weeks - 2 + 2 + 2
- Not to make it shorter, can be longer..!
- six week (4+2)is suggested
- can condense to 4-6 wks
- MAY BE REDUCED TO 6 WEEKS.
- It was tiring and monotonous on certain occasions. Some local sightseeing or breaks may be thought of.
- No reduction required, if at all one week less will be okay, anything less than that will be touch and go...
- Duration may be reduced to 6 week or foreign visit may be extending to two countries with duration of 2 weeks each.
- 4 weeks academy and 10 days foreign study
- allow family during FST, which smart people any way manage
- Could be reduced by one week
- KEEP IT EVERY FIFTH YEAR
- There should be Phase 4 after 5-7 years and then phase 6 which is now phase5.
- 6 weeks training would be better
- Duration should be of eight weeks only.
- Domestic component can be reduced to 4 weeks
- should be reduced to 6 weeks out of which 2 weeks should be foreign visit
- Should have been 6 weeks
- Limit to six weeks with two weeks FST and add two weeks after one year on domain specialization
- program duration should not be more than 6 weeks
- it could be reduced to six weeks
- Please don't reduce the duration of programme
- It should not be curtailed. Officers need breaks and exposures like this.
- programme could have been for 4-6 weeks
- may be reduced to 6 weeks
- no change in duration is warranted

- Duration seems optimal. Add speakers from China instead of focus on Western countries as far as experiential learning are concerned.
- Eight weeks duration is very apt.
- There should not be any reduction in duration. Because cutting duration may result in less productivity and usefulness.
- MCTP should be divided into 2 parts, one with 6 weeks and another of 2 weeks in which the 2 weeks should be devoted to advanced training in specific area
- 6 weeks is apt

15.	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Duration of Domestic Component (6 weeks)	1	1	9	16	23		83.60
	2.00	2.00	18.00	32.00	46.00		

2) Suggestions, if any:

- It should not be more than 4 weeks (2+2)
- I would suggest for 4 weeks duration of domestic component
- 3-4 weeks
- six weeks is fine if the FST is designed at the end of the training programme, otherwise in the present it could be reduced by a week or so
- Can it be reduced to 5 weeks?
- may be reduce to 4 week (3 week in the beginning and 1 week after FT)
- make it 4 weeks
- get some more people from field, avoid elite capture
- Five weeks
- INCREASE TIME FOR FAMILY
- Foreign tour may be planned after 2 weeks so that there could be more deliberations in last four weeks with reference to foreign study tour.
- duration should be 4 weeks
- 4 weeks
- Should continue to be of six weeks.
- Domestic component can be reduced to 4 weeks
- should be reduced to 4 weeks
- Should have been 4 weeks
- Restrict to 4 weeks
- 4 or 4+1; 1 after foreign study tour
- There should be no reduction in duration

- it could have been completed in 4 weeks
- may be reduced to 4-5 weeks
- It's good. No change.
- 4 weeks

16.	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Duration of Foreign Study Tour (2 weeks)	0	0	4	10	36		92.80
	0.00	0.00	8.00	20.00	72.00		

2) Suggestions, if any:

- Can be made two country FST
- 2 weeks to continue
- 1 week
- FST should be at the end of the course
- It should be 3 weeks.
- Can it be enhanced to three weeks with some recess for sightseeing?
- 2 week is sufficient
- May be allowed to visit 2 countries like Canada and France and 2 weeks each
- 10 days enough
- just right
- keep for three weeks
- more field visits should be included
- 2 weeks is good
- Should continue to be of two weeks.
- Should have been in last
- Add more field visits
- 2 in case of total length of program being 6 or 1 in the format 4+ 1fst+1
- May be we can have this component at the end of the course
- There should not be any reduction in duration. Visit to France and partner institute Science Po was a real value for money.
- it may be more focused on the areas relevant to the Problems faced by India with the existing set of constraints
- may be reduced to a week
- Good. No change.
- Duration of course should be 6 weeks i.e, 3+2+1
- week -10 days

17.	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Faculty-mix of Academicians and Practitioners	0	0	3	16	31		91.20
	0.00	0.00	6.00	32.00	62.00		

2) Suggestions, if any:

- More international academicians from reputed foreign universities can be invited, who are India relevant.
- To continue
- Practitioners of actual politics were sorely missed. policy module without political input leaves the module incomplete
- HAVE COMBINED DINNER WITH OT AND FACULTY
- Good Mix
- Call more practitioners
- good
- More practitioners would be more useful.
- Practitioners from China may be more useful.
- More Practitioners may be involved
- private sector is unrepresented

18.	Poor	Average	Good	Very good	Excellent		W.Average
1) Programme Administration	0	0	1	5	44		97.20
	0.00	0.00	2.00	10.00	88.00		

2) Suggestions, if any:

- Excellent program administration....
- Outstanding.
- Excellent, The Course Coordinator was Outstanding.
- it was well designed course
- KEEP MR TVS FOR LONG TIME AS CC

- One of the Best Course Coordinator
- CC has done a very good job in engaging the participants and coordinating the whole program very well
- Excellent!!

19.

Any other comment/s you wish to make:

- Happy Valley hostel attached b/rooms (ground floor) are very narrow and requires sufficient space. Spaces are available for further extension to match it with the size and comfort of the main rooms.
- phases at every 5 years
- It has given the insight to design good public policy that will also strengthen service delivery & good governance. It will also enhance leadership character.
- Family members of participants should be confined to hostel and dining hall not in office and classes as observed. The hostel and dining hall seems to be a hotel which needs some more restrictions to participants.
- Kudos to the Academy in general and our Course Coordinator in particular. Thank you very much.
- More Economics courses even optional will do and also need to incorporate international institutional and continental experience...comparative analysis on certain select topics of international importance where policy making is being done in India...e.g. for climate change we could have got 2 JS level officers from MEA (UNES) division and MOEF to talk about UNFCCC Negotiations in PARIS in 2015, BRICS or RCEP Negotiations etc..
- It was well designed course, DIRECTOR and CC deserve all appreciation and congratulations
- Very well conducted
- Complete renovate sports complex and lay new tennis courts
- nice programme on policy formulation
- Duration should be not more than 6 weeks. Permission to family should in hostel be completely stopped except to lady officers who have small kids.
- Overall an excellent program will be very useful in future assignments and establishment in work life balance.
- Three cheers to the Director and CC....of course with his team..
- In course of training some real time success models should have been presented
- Overall, very good course, helpful to us in our career.
- 5/5 to the CC
- besides phase academy should start some online modules also
- Course Team has done a commendable job
- excellent course
- Though it does not relate to the mandate of LBSNAA, but during our most of the tenure we work closely with the politicians. It disturbs me to think what is wrong with the system that in spite of good training at LBSNAA since its inception, the country is progressing very slowly, even failed in achieving its welfare goals. The only reason I think is lack of awareness among

politicians. Therefore to achieve the goals of good and effective governance it is necessary to provide training to politicians in different spheres of the governance at an appropriate.

- approach with more case studies and c and anecdotes may be desirable
- The training programme was very meticulously planned.
- Two week training module on subject/ theme specific training programme after Phase IV and before Phase V. participants to choose from basket of advance module courses.
- The programme was coordinated in an outstanding manner by Shri. Tejveer Singh.
- The programme was really a mind opener and excellent in terms of content and presentation.
- Thank you.